

RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL

No. 278

Approved June 12, 2025

RESOLVED, That the Members of the Providence City Council hereby Authorize Approval of the following Contract Award by the Board of Contract and Supply, in accordance with the recommendation made by the Special Commission for the Study of Providence's Waste Management Services. The Director of DPW in collaboration with Waste Management will commission an annual report to be provided to Council no later than September 30 of each fiscal year, outlining Waste Management's progress, statistics, and scope of work as how it relates to the services to be provided per the Contract with the City of Providence. The report will also outline the Department's ongoing progress relating to its educational commitment to the community regarding increasing recycling rates throughout the city. The City Council reserves the right to ask the Department of Public Works, and Waste Management to appear before the City Council annually after the issuance of the report.

Waste Management of Rhode Island
(Department of Public Works)

\$57,689,520.00

IN CITY COUNCIL
JUN 05 2025

READ AND PASSED, AS Amended


RACHEL M. MILLER, PRESIDENT

CLERK

I HEREBY APPROVE.


Mayor

Date:

6/12/25



CITY OF PROVIDENCE
MAYOR BRETT P. SMILEY

ALEJANDRO TIRADO
DIRECTOR OF PURCHASING

April 2, 2025

Tina Mastroianni
City Clerk
City of Providence
25 Dorrance Street
Providence, RI 02903

RE: Request for Referral to City Council and Finance Committee

Dear Madam Clerk Mastroianni:

I hope this letter finds you well. I am writing to formally request that the enclosed award letter be referred to the City Council and Finance Committee for review and approval at the next available meeting.

The letter pertains to the award of the contract for the solicitation titled "Waste Removal Services – Residential" issued by the Department of Public Works on December 2, 2024. Given the importance of this matter, I respectfully ask that it be placed on the agenda for discussion and consideration.

Please confirm receipt of this request and let me know if any additional information or documentation is required. I appreciate your assistance in facilitating this process and look forward to the City Council and Finance Committee deliberations on this matter.

Thank you for your time and attention to this request. Please feel free to contact me at your convenience should you require any further details.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "A. Tirado".

Alejandro Tirado, Ph.D., NIGP-CPP
Director of Purchasing

cc: Courtney Hawkins, Chief Operating Officer
Patricia Coyne-Fague, Director of Public Works

DEPARTMENT OF PURCHASING
Providence City Hall | 25 Dorrance Street, Room 408 | Providence, Rhode Island 02903
401 680 5506 ph | 401 455 0475 fax
www.providenceri.gov



CITY OF PROVIDENCE
MAYOR BRETT P. SMILEY

PATRICIA A. COYNE-FAGUE, Esq.
DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS

March 27, 2025
The Honorable Brett P. Smiley
Chairman, Board of Contract and Supply
City Hall
25 Dorrance Street
Providence, RI 02903

RE: Waste Removal Services -Residential - 3-Year Contract with Two 2-Year Options for Renewal

Please note that the term of this contract will be for five (5) years consistent with the final proposal revision submitted during negotiations.

MinuteTraq ID#: 47247

Minority Participation: 0% MBE, 0% WBE

Account Code:

1. 101-506-53402
2. 101-506-52350

Dear Mayor Smiley,

DATE OF BID OPENING: December 2, 2024

RECOMMENDED BIDDER & THEIR ADDRESS:

- Waste Management of Rhode Island. 26 Patriot Place, Suite 300, Foxborough, MA 02035
- TOTAL AMOUNT RECOMMENDED: Total amount not to exceed \$56,189,520 (Pending budget approval).
- In response to our request for proposal regarding the above entitled, our department received the following bids.

	VENDOR NAME	RATES	Score/Rank
Trash/Recycling/Mattress/Yard Waste/Bulky Items			
1	Waste Management of Rhode Island	Unit Price Bid	102/1
2	Green View Tree Service, LLC	Unit Price Bid	79/2 (disqualified)
Mattress Removal Only			
3	BP Express, LLC	Unit Price Bid	59/3 (disqualified)
Curbside Compost Only			
4	Black Earth Compost	Not considered for evaluation	
5	Bootstrap Compost, Inc.	Not considered for evaluation	
6	The Compost Plant L3C dba ReMix Organics Co	Not considered for evaluation	

- On the basis of said bids, we recommend the low bidder, as identified on LINE 1, whose bid has met the specifications.
- On the basis of said bids, we recommend the bidder identified on LINE: _____. While not the apparent low bidder, a review of the bids reveal that it is in the best interest of the City to reject the low bidder. See the Explanation box below.
- On the basis of said bids, we recommend multiple bidders identified on LINES: _____. A review of the bids reveal that it is in the best interest of the City to utilize these bidders together. See the Explanation box below.

700 Allens Avenue, Providence, Rhode Island 02905
Phone 401-467-7950/Fax 401-941-2567
www.providenceri.gov/public-works/



CITY OF PROVIDENCE
MAYOR BRETT P. SMILEY

PATRICIA A. COYNE-FAGUE, Esq.
DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS

Explanation: Consistent with the information provided in the solicitation, an evaluation team was assembled to review responses for this solicitation. Six responses to this solicitation were received:

- Two bids for trash/recycling/mattress/yard waste/bulky items:
 - Waste Management
 - Green View Tree Service
- One bid for mattress removal only:
 - BP Express
- Three bids for curbside compost only:
 - Black Earth Compost
 - Bootsrap Compost
 - The Compost Plant L3C dba ReMix Organics Co

Curbside composting was an optional voluntary service. However, bidders for curbside composting submitted prices were not considered for evaluation. The City may explore this option in the future depending on funding availability.

The City opted to evaluate proposals for the following services: solid waste collection, recycling collection, yard debris collection, and the collection of bulky items and mattresses. The review team used the evaluation criteria provided in the solicitation to score each of the bids (see page 23 of the RFP). The minimum passing score was 90 points. Based on this criteria, both Green View Tree Services and BP Express did not receive a score high enough (90) to avoid disqualification, leaving Waste Management as the only bidder with a qualifying score.

Additional documentation to support the decision for this award is attached to this letter.

Respectfully submitted,


Patricia A. Coyne-Fague, Esq.
Director of Public Works


Financial Approval:



Department Subject Matter Expert: Courtney Hawkins, Chief Operating Officer

By signing, the subject matter expert certifies the following: That the recommended vendor(s) is/are the lowest, qualified bidder(s) with regards to the corresponding specifications. That all bids corresponding to this award were reviewed for completeness and that the recommended bidder's submission is inclusive of all required documents.

Bidder	Eval. #1	Eval. #2	Eval. #3	Eval. #4	Eval. #5	Eval. #6	Eval. #7
Waste Mgt.	95	100	110	102	109	90	109
Green View	56	73	95	90	91	50	98
BP Express	44	50	80	47	79	50	62

Average for all evaluators:

Waste Mgt.: 102

Green View: 79

BP Express: 59


[EXTERNAL] RE: RE: RE: Pricing

From Pacek, Ed <EPacek@wm.com>

Date Thu 3/27/2025 9:18 PM

To Hawkins, Courtney <Chawkins@providenceri.gov>; Louro, Heather <HLouro@wm.com>

Cc Coyne-Fague, Patricia <Pcoynefague@providenceri.gov>; Tirado, Alejandro <Atirado@providenceri.gov>; Burgess, Chevell <Cburgess@providenceri.gov>

 1 attachment (186 KB)

MWA Residential Contamination_Report-03.03.2025-03.08.2025.xlsx;

Good Evening Courtney,

We appologize for the delay. Please find the requested Smart Truck related information below and attached.

6) Please provide an example of a Smart Truck report that shows the different data collected by the technology at the household level (e.g. contaminated recycling, no cart out, overflowing cart, etc.).

We have provided an example "Recycling Contamination Report" from MWA, Iowa. Please note the links contained in the report allow MWA to review the images and video associated with each event. However, unfortunately, MWA's links provided in the report are not available for Providence to view.

We would recommend scheduling a time for a demonstration of our Smart Truck platform so the City can see first hand the video capability as well as the service verification and contamination identification features.

7) Please provide a reference for an urban municipality using Smart Truck to track recycling contamination.

Metro Waste Authority (MWA) is a group of 22 municipalities located in the Des Moines, IA metro area. **The group consists of ~108,000 homes** (and a much greater population). WM's agreement with MWA includes utilizing Smart Truck to identify recycling contamination. Each week, MWA receives a weekly report of violators, a recent report is provided as an example. If you would like to speak to someone at MWA regarding our Smart Truck program, feel free to contact:

Cassie Riley
Community Engagement Manager



Metro Waste Authority

Metro Waste Authority

300 E. Locust St. | Ste. 100 | Des Moines | Iowa | 50309



City of Providence

Proposal for Waste Removal Services - Revised

Presented 3/22/2025

Pricing

Curbside Collection

Service Type		Fiscal Year 2025-2026	Fiscal Year 2026-2027	Fiscal Year 2027-2028	Fiscal Year 2028-2029	Fiscal Year 2029-2030
Refuse Removal	Annual Cost	\$ 5,042,520	\$ 5,244,221	\$ 5,453,990	\$ 5,672,149	\$ 5,899,035
Recycling Removal	Annual Cost	\$ 4,042,272	\$ 4,203,963	\$ 4,372,121	\$ 4,547,006	\$ 4,728,887
Yard Debris & Christmas Trees	Annual Cost	\$ 1,119,317	\$ 1,164,090	\$ 1,210,653	\$ 1,259,079	\$ 1,309,443
		\$ 10,204,109	\$ 10,612,273	\$ 11,036,764	\$ 11,478,235	\$ 11,937,364

Additional Pricing

		Fiscal Year 2025-2026	Fiscal Year 2026-2027	Fiscal Year 2027-2028	Fiscal Year 2028-2029	Fiscal Year 2029-2030
Bulk Item	per Item	\$ 20.00	\$ 21.00	\$ 22.00	\$ 23.00	\$ 24.00
White Good	per Item	\$ 35.00	\$ 37.00	\$ 39.00	\$ 40.00	\$ 41.00
Mattress	per Item	\$ 33.00	\$ 34.50	\$ 36.00	\$ 37.00	\$ 39.00
Option for RFID Reading Package	Annual Cost	\$ 170,000	\$ 176,800	\$ 183,872	\$ 191,227	\$ 198,876

The above pricing is based on the following:

- Five-year initial term
- Purchasing five new trucks to ensure no vehicles exceed ten years in age at any point over the contract term
- Allowing WM to continue to start service in the City each day at 5AM
- Purchasing an additional vehicle and running an additional trash route to accommodate the 50% increase in trash capacity at the curb resulting in the change from 65-gallon to 95-gallon carts
- 37 weeks of yard waste + 3 weeks of tree collection + option for additional weeks
- Smart Truck video service verification and recycling contamination audit capabilities
- One additional full-time staff member to assist Providence in managing new technology offerings and reporting
- Bulky Item and White Good collection will be charged to the residents on a per item basis. City may elect to subsidize a portion of this cost
- The option for the City to request rear-load trucks to target recycling contamination in select neighborhoods
- Inclusion of a fuel-adjustment formula
- Option for installation of RFID reading hardware, ongoing software support and communication / subscription fees
- Unless expressly modified above all terms are based on our proposal dated December 2, 2024

[EXTERNAL] RE: Pricing

From Pacek, Ed <EPacek@wm.com>

Date Tue 3/18/2025 10:48 AM

To Hawkins, Courtney <Chawkins@providenceri.gov>; Louro, Heather <HLouro@wm.com>

Cc Coyne-Fague, Patricia <Pcoynefague@providenceri.gov>; Calise, Michael <Mcalise@providenceri.gov>; Tirado, Alejandro <Atirado@providenceri.gov>

Good Morning Courtney,

We appreciate the opportunity to have met with you and the rest of the City staff yesterday.

Thank you for providing the specifications of service. We will get back to you by the end of the week with the requested pricing.

Thanks

Ed Pacek

Area Director
Public Sector Solutions
epacek@wm.com

Cell: 508-873-3204



From: Hawkins, Courtney <Chawkins@providenceri.gov>

Sent: Tuesday, March 18, 2025 8:44 AM

To: Pacek, Ed <EPacek@wm.com>; Louro, Heather <HLouro@wm.com>

Cc: Coyne-Fague, Patricia <Pcoynefague@providenceri.gov>; Calise, Michael <Mcalise@providenceri.gov>; Tirado, Alejandro <Atirado@providenceri.gov>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Pricing

Ed & Heather,

Thanks again for the productive work sessions regarding Waste Management's proposed services for the City of Providence.

In follow-up, as discussed, please provide pricing for these proposed Service Levels:

1. 5-year contract
2. Service to start at 5 am, M-F
3. 95-gallon Trash and Recycling bins, removed weekly
4. Yard waste consistent with the current yard waste removal schedule (with the option to expand in future years).
5. Please provide an option with an RFID reader and without

(as discussed, Bulky & White Good shared cost with resident, the city can elect to change resident share over time).

Other options and scope as outlined in Option 2 of proposal to be worked out in the scope of work. Please let me know if there are other questions or variables that require feedback to get to final pricing.

Best,
Courtney

Courtney E Hawkins

Chief Operating Officer

Pronoun: She/Her

Office of Mayor Brett P. Smiley

Providence City Hall

25 Dorrance Street

Providence, RI 02903

Chawkins@providenceri.gov

(401) 680-5534 Call to Connect | [PVD311](https://www.pvd311.com) TTY Relay: via 711

Recycling is a good thing. Please recycle any printed emails.

City of Providence Finance Department
Waste management 5 Year Contract Fiscal Note
FY2026 - FY2030

	Fiscal Year 2026	Fiscal Year 2027	Fiscal Year 2028	Fiscal Year 2029	Fiscal Year 2030	Total
Refuse Removal	5,042,520	5,244,221	5,453,990	5,672,149	5,899,035	27,311,915
Recycling Removal	4,042,272	4,203,963	4,372,121	4,547,006	4,728,887	21,894,249
Yard Waste & Christmas Trees	1,119,317	1,164,090	1,210,653	1,259,079	1,309,443	6,062,582
	10,204,109	10,612,274	11,036,764	11,478,234	11,937,365	55,268,746
Bulk Items	250,000	275,000	300,000	325,000	350,000	1,500,000
White Goods	130,500	140,940	151,380	156,600	161,854	741,274
Mattresses	33,000	34,500	36,000	37,000	39,000	179,500
	413,500	450,440	487,380	518,600	550,854	2,420,774
Total	10,617,609	11,062,714	11,524,144	11,996,834	12,488,219	57,689,520

Personnel costs	Number of FTEs	wage	Hours/year	
Drivers & Mechanics	50	\$ 29.03	2,206	\$3,842,411
Supervisors	5	\$ 40.00	2080	\$416,000
Division Director				\$96,000
Call Center Specialists	5	18	2206	\$238,248
Call Center Supervisor	1			\$55,000
Administrative costs (estimated at 15%)				\$4,647,659
				\$697,148.82
Total personnel				\$5,344,808

Other than personnel costs				
One time expenses				
Equipment				
Garbage Trucks	20	\$330,000		\$6,600,000
Rear Loading Truck	3	\$250,000		\$750,000
Other Trucks	4	\$750,000		\$3,000,000
Technology				\$500,000
				\$10,350,000
Reoccurring expenses				
Fleet replacement program				\$1,350,000
Gas Estimate				\$1,075,784
Parts/Supplies/Uniforms				\$500,000
				\$2,925,784

Total Annual Cost	\$8,270,591
Total Upfront Cost	\$10,350,000
Not included	
New Garage & Maintenance Facility	
Additional Land for DPW	